

Setti D. Warren Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts

Department of Planning and Development 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone (617) 796-1120 Telefax (617) 796-1142 TDD/TTY (617) 796-1089 www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens Director

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS **NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: November 26, 2013

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202

7:00 p.m.

ATTENDING: Donald Lang, Chair

> William Roesner, Member Jean Fulkerson, Member Laura Fitzmaurice. Alternate

See Attendance List

David Morton, Member ABSENT:

> Rodney Barker, Member **Donald Tellalian, Alternate Leonard Sherman, Alternate**

Nancy Grissom, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate **Brian Lever, Staff**

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with Donald Lang presiding as Chair. Voting permanent members were Lang, Grissom, Roesner, Armstrong, and Fulkerson. Alternate members Fitzmaurice and Klapper also voted. Brian Lever acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded.

War Memorial Artifacts – Request for Letter of Support

City Archivist Nancy Kougeas discussed a pending application for Community Preservation Act (CPA) funds to survey artifacts in the City's War Memorial. Staff stated that the City has in its collection pieces dating back to the Civil War including clothing, weapons, photographs, and dioramas. The intention is to inventory the collection and assess the condition of pieces for conservation measures. The City Archivist and City Clerk are requesting a letter of support for the project. As part of determining eligibility for CPA funds, the Commission will have to determine whether or not the collection has historic significance. Commission members reviewed the application for funding.

Kougeas discussed the collection and stated that this was an initial survey and that latter phases of the project would involve conservation of particular pieces. Roesner asked if the requested funding was adequate and Kougeas responded that it was for this phase of the project. Grissom motioned to find the collection historically significant and issue a letter of support with Roesner seconding.



At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 26, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>7-0</u>,

RESOLVED to designate the artifacts in the War Memorial as a historically significant resource and to issue a letter of support for the proposed survey.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair William Roesner, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Jean Fulkerson, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Ellen Klapper, Alternate

33 Crestwood Road - Demolition Review

Property owner Jo Tango and architect Tim Blanchard presented an application to waive the demolition delay at this property. Staff stated that this 1957 Contemporary designed by the architecture firm of Hoover & Hill is located in a neighborhood of other mid-20th century residences such as another Contemporary residence and a Cape style residence as well as newer homes from the 1990s through 2000s. The building was originally owned by Martha and Loomis Patrick. Loomis was the President of the West Newton Cooperative Bank. The building was later owned by Seiji Ozawa, a noted Japanese conductor and music director of the Boston Symphony Orchestra. The one-story building features a brick exterior and is partially screened from view due to existing vegetation. This building was found preferably preserved at the May 2013 meeting and the Commission approved the design direction for a replacement building at the October 2013 meeting. Commission members reviewed the application, plans, and photographs of the property and surrounding neighborhood.

Tango and Blanchard provided information on the revised design. Blanchard stated that he had added changes in plane to the garage and moved it slightly toward the rear of the lot. Fitzmaurice asked if the garage would be visible from the street and Blanchard responded that it would. Roesner asked what the roof material would be and Blanchard responded that it would be coated steel. Grissom motioned to approve a waiver of the demolition delay with Armstrong seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 26, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>7-0</u>,

RESOLVED to issue a waiver of the demolition delay for the proposed new residence at <u>33 Crestwood Road</u> based upon the plans submitted for the replacement building.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair William Roesner, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Jean Fulkerson, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Ellen Klapper, Alternate

473 Grove Street - Demolition Review

Scott Rumley presented an application to partially demolish the residence. Staff stated that this circa 1870 workers cottage was owned by the Crehore family and used to house workers in Lower Falls, in particular



mill workers. The Crehore family operated a mill manufacturing paper, one of a few paper manufacturers in the area. Various different tenants resided here. The building largely retains its form with the exception of a large dormer that has been added to the front roof. The original windows have been removed and replaced, but the building still has its shingle siding and decorative stick-work. The bay window/entrance and stick-work suggest Gothic Revival or Stick style. The property is located at the corner of Grove Street, DeForest Road, and Route 128. The surrounding neighborhood context consists of Capes and Ranches, part of the mid 20thcentury development that occurred in Lower Falls. Despite its isolated location away from other 19th-century buildings and the alterations that have occurred, the building has a strong association with the mill history of Lower Falls.

Commission members reviewed the application, historical documentation on the property, and photographs of the property. Rumley stated that it was his intention to construct a new single-family residence. Fitzmaurice suggested that the existing building could be incorporated into a new design. Fulkerson and Armstrong suggested that an addition could be added to the building or another alteration to accommodate more space. Bill Renke (142 Cornell Street) expressed support for the building's preservation. Commission members also expressed support for the building's preservation. Grissom motioned to find the building preferably preserved with Armstrong seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>November 26, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>7-0</u>,

RESOLVED to find the residence at <u>473 Grove Street</u> preferably preserved based upon its condition and historical association with the development of Lower Falls.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair
William Roesner, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Administrative Discussion:

Minutes

The October 2013 meeting minutes were approved unanimously with Roesner abstaining.

Revolving Fund

Staff discussed the creation of a revolving fund to fund the print and sale of out of print Historical Commission documents. Staff further stated that this would involve creating an account that would be used to deposit funds from sale of documents to be used for printing additional copies. Grissom volunteered to work on this project and recommended that the creation of the design guidelines booklet be mentioned in the Planning Department Friday Report.

1445 Centre Street - Demolition Review

Jeff Miller presented an application to partially demolish the residence. Staff stated that this 1925 one-story Craftsman/Bungalow is located in a neighborhood largely consisting of two-story buildings including Colonial Revival and Tudor style residences. The first resident was Emile Barrier, a physician in Boston. Ownership of this property changed frequently after its construction. In the 1930s the property was owned by Grace Stafford, an artist and later by James and Lenore Donahue. James was the president of Newton Motors. With the exception of a small addition at the rear, the building retains its form. Windows

have been replaced, but other features and details such as the clapboard siding and rafter tails remain. The building was designed by Quincy architect J. Winthrop Pratt. This building is an anomaly in the area being one-story with few other one-story buildings nearby, except for a Cape and Ranch. The Commission has reviewed the demolition of this building in 2007 and demolition of the roof in 1998, in both cases the building was found preferably preserved. Commission members reviewed the application, historical documentation on the property, and photographs of the property.

Miller stated that the proposal is to demolish the roof and add a second story. Miller further stated that plans are not yet available for the proposed project. Lang stated that the Commission could waive the demolition delay if imposed, based upon an approved design. Commission members noted that the building had been found preferably preserved previously. Grissom motioned to find the building preferably preserved with Roesner seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 26, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 1445 Centre Street preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair William Roesner, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Jean Fulkerson, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Ellen Klapper, Alternate

58 Ferncroft Road - Demolition Review

Architect Peter Sachs presented an application to partially demolish the residence. Staff stated that this 1939 Colonial Revival residence is located in a neighborhood of other Colonial Revival residences as well as Capes, Split-Levels, and Tudors. The building was designed by Newton architect Albert Kreider and built by the Ballou family who were Waltham based builders. The first owners were Louis and Beatrice Wadman. Louis was President of a clothing company. Aside from a rear addition the building retains its form. Windows have been replaced, but other details remain including the shingle siding and stone veneer. The design is typical of a Garrison Colonial Revival seen in Newton with the projecting second story. The applicants are proposing to construct an addition that envelops the majority of the front façade and the north façade. Although this building fits within the time period of construction for this neighborhood, there is a variety of styles seen on the street, even within Colonial Revival style itself. Commission members reviewed the application, plans, and photographs of the property and neighborhood.

Sachs discussed the project including altering the front and north facades as well as removing the attached garage and roofs of the one-story additions. Commission member's discussed the building and the surrounding neighborhood. Lang stated that the determination of whether or not the building should be found preferably preserved is based upon the building's present condition not what is proposed. Lang further stated that he felt the building did not warrant being found preferably preserved. Isabelle Albeck (240 Windsor Road) expressed support for instituting the demolition delay. Fulkerson and Armstrong stated that they felt the building should not be found preferably preserved. Grissom motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Fulkerson seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 26, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>6-1</u>,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 58 Ferncroft Road not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: **Donald Lang, Chair** Nancy Grissom, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Jean Fulkerson, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Voting in the Negative: William Roesner, Member

99 Osborne Path – Demolition Review

Fred and Lyn Starikov presented an application to partially demolish the residence. Staff stated that this 1948 Ranch style residence is located within Oak Hill Park on the path system. The first residents were Clark and Mary Fisher. Clark worked as a salesman. The building has had additions added to the front façade on L-Roadway and its original windows removed and replaced. The surrounding neighborhood context consists of original Oak Hill Park residences in largely original condition, altered Oak Hill Park residences, and new construction. Adjacent to this property are a newly constructed residence and an original residence that has had a substantial addition. Other buildings in the cul-de-sac and on Osborne Path are in various states of preservation. Commission members reviewed the application, and photographs of the property and neighborhood.

Commission members discussed the building and the neighborhood. Lang stated that he felt the building should be found not preferably preserved. Fulkerson stated that the area has substantially changed. Roesner stated that the building was on the path system and that in the past the Commission had placed a special emphasis on preserving these buildings. Grissom motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Klapper seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 26, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>6-1</u>,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 99 Osborne Path not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: **Donald Lang, Chair** Nancy Grissom, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Jean Fulkerson, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Ellen Klapper, Alternate

William Roesner, Member

Voting in the Negative:

30 Beethoven Avenue (Zervas School) - Demolition Review

Adam Gilmore from the Newton Public Building's Department, Melissa Gagnon from Joslin Lesser, and Alderman Fuller presented an application to demolish the residence. Staff stated that this 1954 International style school building is located in a neighborhood developed after World War II that originally consisted largely of Ranch style residences. The building was designed by the architecture firm of Kilham, Hopkins, Greeley, & Brodie. The construction of the Zervas School and surrounding neighborhood was the result of the increasing demand for housing and growing population in Newton during the postwar era. The multi-story masonry building is an unusual example of mid-20th century institutional architecture. Newton has other examples of mid-20th century architecture, but they are most often in the form of Cape, Ranch, Contemporary, and Split-Level residences. International style is a rare architectural style in Newton. Practioners of this style such as Walter Gropius and Sam Glazer designed International style homes on Drumlin Road in Oak Hill in contrast to the numerous Ranches surrounding them.

The building has been altered with the construction of one-story modular classroom additions as well as replacement windows, but the overall character of the building is intact. The surrounding neighborhood context has changed dramatically since the 1950s as many of the Ranch homes that once dominated the streetscape have been demolished and replaced with larger modern residences. Despite the alterations, the building is a rare architectural example in Newton. Commission members reviewed the application, historical documentation on the property, and photographs of the property.

Gilmore stated that the project was in the early planning stages and that at present they were considering either replacing portions of the building or the entirety depending on the condition and space requirements. Fuller stated that there are site constraints with nearby wetlands that complicate the reuse of the building. Gilmore stated that they may consider adding additional floors, but it was unclear if the building could support that. Commission members expressed support for reusing the building as it is an unusual example of mid-20th century architecture. Fulkerson stated that she felt the Commission should hold the City to the same standards as private property owners. Armstrong expressed his support for preserving and reusing the building. Roesner motioned to find the building preferably preserved with Grissom seconding, this motion passed. Grissom motioned to provide a list of features recommended for preservation with Armstrong seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>November 26, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>6-1</u>,

RESOLVED to find the Zervas School at <u>30 Beethoven Avenue</u> preferably preserved as an excellent example of International style architecture.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Voting in the Negative:

Donald Lang, Chair William Roesner, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Jean Fulkerson, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>November 26, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>7-0</u>,

RESOLVED to recommend preserving the following features of the Zervas School at <u>30 Beethoven Avenue</u> including the variation of roof heights, the strip windows, stone veneer, front entrance, roof overhangs, and the courtyard effect on the southern façade of the building.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair
William Roesner, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

51 Plainfield Road - Demolition Review

Armando Petruzziello presented an application for a waiver of the demolition delay based upon plans for a replacement building. Staff stated that this 1922 Dutch Colonial residence is located with the Pine Ridge

Road and Plainfield Street National Register Historic District and therefore subject to an 18-month demolition delay. The district is listed for its architectural significance as an example of a transitional neighborhood with late 19th century architectural styles of Queen Anne and Shingle mixing with Colonial Revival, Craftsman and Tudor styles of the 20th century. The neighborhood is also listed for its association with the development of the village of Waban as a suburban neighborhood accessible to Boston via the train. The building appears to have no substantial alterations and retains its shiplap siding, windows, and wood trim. The building is also consistent in scale and style with others in the neighborhood and is listed as a contributing building to the district. An application for a waiver of the demolition delay was denied at the September 2013 meeting. Commission members reviewed the application, historical documentation on the property, plans, and photographs of the property.

Fitzmaurice asked why the building could not be reused and Petruzziello responded that the building has low ceilings, a choppy layout, and was not cost effective to renovate. Lang suggested that an addition could be constructed at the rear of the building. Grissom stated that the proposed building placed most of the bulk of the building at the street unlike the existing building. Isabelle Albeck (240 Windsor Road) expressed support for the building's preservation. Armstrong noted that the building is listed on the National Register and stated that he felt it should be preserved. Grissom motioned to deny a waiver of the demolition delay with Fulkerson seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>November 26, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>6-1</u>,

RESOLVED to deny a waiver of the demolition delay at 51 Plainfield Road.

Voting in the Affirmative:
Donald Lang, Chair
Nancy Grissom, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Voting in the Negative: William Roesner, Member

110 Hawthorne Avenue - Demolition Review

Property owner Richard Sewall and architect Henry Arnaudo presented an application for a waiver of the demolition delay based upon plans for a replacement building. Staff stated that this 1924 Colonial Revival residence is located in Auburndale near the Auburndale Local Historic District. Much of Hawthorne Avenue is within the district, however this section (south of Aspen Avenue) where it is a dead-end adjacent to the Woodland Golf Course is not. This section of the street consists of late-19th century and early-20th century residences; it was initially considered for inclusion in the district, but ultimately excluded. The immediate area consists of Queen Anne, Stick, and Colonial Revival style residences representing two waves of development from the 1890s through the early 1900's and then the 1920s through the 1930s. While there are some newer replacement residences on Hawthorne Avenue and Aspen Road, the majority of the original architecture is still present.

The house was built by Perley Meisner a local carpenter and builder living in Auburndale and the first owner was Arthur and Emma Wilson. Arthur worked as a painter. The building retains its form and massing and details including exposed rafter tails with few alterations. One window on the first floor of the northern façade has been replaced. The building lacks substantial historic architectural features and is simple in design, but fits within the streetscape. The building is located at the end of the dead-end and demolition of this building would not have as substantial an effect as one of the other buildings. The Commission has permitted demolition of nearby 78 Hawthorne Avenue and 42 Aspen Avenue, but both of these buildings had more substantial alterations. The Commission also found 83 Aspen Avenue a 1920s

Dutch Colonial preferably preserved. The Commission found this building (110 Hawthorne Avenue) preferably preserved at the February 2013 meeting. Commission members reviewed the application, historical documentation on the property, plans, and photographs of the property.

Commission members reviewed the proposed design and offered suggestions for revisions. Armstrong suggested a different exterior material for the basement level. Grissom suggested replacing the ganged windows with single windows. Lang suggested removing the forward projecting gable end on the front façade and Armstrong suggested removing the gable end over the attached garage. Grissom noted that exterior materials were unspecified. Grissom motioned to approve the design direction with Armstrong seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>November 26, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0,

RESOLVED to approve the design direction for a replacement building as part of a waiver of the demolition delay at <u>110 Hawthorne Avenue</u> with further review and approval by the Commission required and the following suggestions for revision: (1) that the belt course wraparound the building; (2) that a different exterior material be used for the basement level; (3) that the roof overhangs be extended; and (4) that exterior materials information be provided.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair William Roesner, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Mark Armstrong, Member Jean Fulkerson, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Administrative Discussion Continued:

Historical Commission designee on Community Preservation Committee (CPC) Grissom stated that the CPC was in need of a designee on CPC and briefly discussed the committee's role in funding projects. Fitzmaurice expressed interest in filling the role.

Meeting adjourned 10:00 PM